Parliamentary Debate
First Affirmative Constructive Speech Outline (with 1AR)
Lester Robancho, Prime Minister
10 December 2013

I. Introduction

A. Welcome Mr. Speaker, Members of the Parliament, and Members of the Loyal Opposition.

B. Resolved: THST the Federal Government implement comprehensive immigration reform.

C. Definition of Key Terms of the Resolution

1. “Implement” is defined as being written, passed, and finally enacted through Congress and the President.

2. “Immigration reform” refers to the The Border Security, Economic Opportunity, and Immigration Modernization Act of 2013 (S.744) that has been introduced and is currently being considered in the Senate.

D. The criteria here are defined as concerns for American citizens and the US economy.

E. Introduction and Preview Statement

1. Introduction

Tina and Lan Nguyen were living in Communist controlled Vietnam. Desperate to protect herself and her son from persecution, Tina decided to escape from Vietnam in a boat. Her sister, Lan sold all of her gold to help her, and in 1989 Tina and her son said goodbye to her sister before casting off. Tina promised that she would get Lan into the United States once she got there. It wasn’t what Tina was expecting. She spent two years in a refugee camp before she ever got to enter the US. When she finally did, she found herself homeless. She struggled working as a hotel housekeeper, taught herself English, and finally in 2000, passed her US citizenship test. She immediately filed a petition to sponsor her sister so she could join her. It took Tina 19 years to do this. The immigration system here in the US is broken and outdated, frozen in time as if it was still 1996. It is now almost 2014, and our society, values, and the economy has changed substantially since. We need to change our immigration policies to address these changes, and stop taking our time with it as if it’s not important.

Sources:
2. Preview Statement

Today, I will support my position by first stating the Ill, that our current immigration laws are outdated. Second, I will introduce the Blame, that legislators are not taking immigration as seriously as they should be. Next, my partner will present our Cure, our plan to update the laws on illegal immigration, and finally our Cost/Benefits, which will examine the economic and social costs of our plan, and how America will benefit from updated legislation.

Transition: Let’s look at the first issue, the Ill: the ineffectiveness of current laws.

II. Stock Issue #1: Our current immigration laws are outdated and don’t meet the needs of today’s issues regarding illegal immigrants.

A. The lack of change in America’s “enforcement only” immigration measures negatively impact the country economically and socially (Significance)


   “Today, too many employers game the system by hiring undocumented workers and there are 11 million people living and working in the shadow economy.”


   Tens of billions of dollars have been spent on immigration enforcement since the early 90’s, yet nearly all unauthorized immigrants will eventually succeed in getting in.


   The unauthorized labor force in the US is estimated to be about 5.3 million workers: 700,000 restaurant workers, 250,000 household employees, and 620,000 construction workers, in addition to 1.2 million farm workers. That is a lot of cheap labor doing the work most other people don’t want to do.

   There is obviously a lot at stake here regarding illegal immigration.

B. The current system makes it difficult for immigrants to obtain legal status (Harms)

   Current laws call for a ten year visa cap for many illegal immigrants, separating them from their loved ones and ripping families apart.


   The difficulty in becoming legal leads to high numbers of visa violations and fraud. This creates a negative image of illegal immigrants which antagonizes them. According to a new poll by TIPP, Americans feel that tracking down people with expired visas is the top priority in fighting illegal immigration.


   Most, if not all immigrants who come to the United States come to pursue the American dream for a better life. However current laws prohibit undocumented students from receiving financial aid for college, substantially limiting their opportunities.

   People migrating to the US are obviously seeking a more better life, why make it even harder for them when they get here?

Transition: Now that we know what the problem is with immigration, we'll now look at why these problems exist.

III. Stock Issue #2: Lawmakers continue to make immigration reform a low priority while the nation's economy and values change.

   A. Congress doesn’t take the issue of illegal immigration seriously enough; when they do deal with it, it is only done to address pressure from advocates (structural blame)


      Most in Congress were reluctant to stand up publicly for immigrants when they moved to the subject in early 2000’s. When they came up with their latest iteration in 2007, it was only meant to please conservative lawmakers. The result was a piece of legislation that was distasteful to progressives and immigrants, and conservatives still mocked.

The internal dynamics within the Senate determine the shape of a bill’s final outcome. More specifically, roll call voting may affect a legislator’s decision to vote by the time it is his or her’s turn to vote.

It is no doubt that Congress has many critics and this evidence only magnifies their reason.

B. America’s position as a hegemonic humanitarian world power is often forgotten or not considered (attitudinal blame).


What is lacking in the discussion of immigration reform is the humane consideration of the families, women, and children who most likely experience the stress or trauma as a result of migration.


The twenty-first century is seeing a new world where globalization is rapidly replacing nationalism. People, ideas, and goods cross into other countries almost instantaneously. Americans tend to forget that the United States has always been a country that takes pride in a heritage that promotes openness, tolerance, and diversity. Making America an attractive destination for immigrants is key to our expanse and growth as a nation.


Much of the anti-immigration rhetoric can possibly be, not a true fervor for the law, but rather veiled racism.

America has its place in the international community as a country of humanitarian causes for a reason. We should all start acting like it is.

IV. Summary

A. So far, the Government has established first, what’s wrong, that the way we deal with illegal immigration right now is a thing of the past and is in need of an update, and second, who is to blame, which is that Congress tends to take the issue of immigration very lightly.

B. America is a nation of immigrants. No other country has the diversity that the United States has been able to achieve. As a result, the US has become home to a melting pot of ideas, cultures,
values, and knowledge. We should preserve this rather than close the door on the rest of the world in a lonely state of isolationism.
First Affirmative Rebuttal
Lester Robancho, Prime Minister

I. Introduction

A. Welcome again, everyone.

B. Let’s briefly review our stock issues: first, the Ill, that our current immigration laws are outdated. Second, the Blame, that Congress is not taking the issue of immigration seriously. Third, the Cure, our plan to pass comprehensive immigration reform by updating our laws on illegal immigration. And fourth, our Cost and Benefits.

C. I will now address the opposition’s three weakest arguments: that illegal immigrants are taking opportunities from US citizens, that illegal immigration is hurting the economy, and that current border enforcement should be further enforced as it is.

II. Rebuttals

1. Illegal immigration is hurting the economy.


US and academic business leaders have actually lobbied hard to include reforms that would make it easier for highly skilled foreigners to stay in the US. A man named Fu Chiu, an immigrant from China, was looking for a job with a US biotech company after getting his Ph.D. in molecular biology from the University of Illinois. He wasn’t able to stay too long because his student visa expired a year after graduation.

2. Illegal immigration is hurting the economy.


Regardless whether or not this is true, the S.744 will generate trillions in new economic growth and create jobs. This will be a net benefit for America, according to conservative economists.

3. Border enforcement should be further enforced as it is now.


There are many reasons that our current border enforcement will only lead to worse situations. First, fencing off our neighbors to the south will only fuel anti-American sentiment throughout the world and harm relations with our allies and potential partners. Next, closing the door on new immigrants will deprive the American work force of skills, talent, and ambition. Probably the most important for future
generations, is that it will create a society that lacks a solid understanding of the world beyond our borders.

Transition: Now that the opposition’s arguments have been rendered invalid, I will briefly go over what the government’s stock issues are.

III. Conclusion

A. First, the ill, current immigration laws are outdated by today’s needs, next the blame, that Congress need to tend to these immigration problems, the cure, that current laws be modernized, and the cost and benefits of our plan to pass immigration reform.

B. We have to remember that all immigrants, illegal or not, are human beings. Tina Nguyen had to struggle for 19 years to find a life here in the US and repay her sister’s sacrifices by giving her a chance to come here as well. There is an estimated 11 million illegal immigrants in the country currently, with most if not all with their own families to support. There are also countless numbers of people trying to cross our borders right now. It would be impossible to simply just keep them out. It would also be impractical to deport 11 million people. So instead of doing things how we’ve always been doing, why don’t we try something new? A little change never hurt anyone.
References


